NIAGARA FRONTIER TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY

Monthly Board Meeting

December 9, 2021

```
            Transcript of Video Recording
of Proceedings held at NIAGARA FRONTIER TRANSPORTATION
AUTHORITY, 181 Ellicott Street, Buffalo, New York,
stenographically transcribed by VALERIE A. ROSATI, Notary
Public.
```

MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM:
Sister Denise Roche (Chair)
Commissioner Adam Perry
Kimberley Minkel (Executive Director)
David State (General Counsel)
John Cox (Chief Financial Officer)
William Vanecek (Director, Aviation)
Tom George (Director, Public Transit)
Helen Tederous (Director, Public Affairs)
John Schaefer (Director, Engineering)
Karen Novo (Director, Human Resources)
Darren Kempner (Manager, Government Affairs)
Steven Duquette (Chief Information Officer)
Christopher Ruminski (Manager, Financial
Planning \& Analysis)
Pat Dalton (Director, Internal Audit and Corp. Compliance)
Athena Hutchins (Executive Director, NITTEC)

MEMBERS ON THE PHONE:
Commissioner LaVonne Ansari
Commissioner Anthony Baynes
Commissioner Rev. Mark Blue
Commissioner Michael Hughes
Commissioner Philip Wilcox
Rich Guarino (Acting Executive Director, GBNRTC)

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Welcome. I'm calling to order
the December, 2021 meeting of the Niagara
Frontier Transportation Authority and Niagara
Frontier Transit Metro system. And this is our regular board meeting. And good afternoon.

Thank you to all of you who are joining us.

And we will begin right away. This is an important meeting. Of course every one is, but at this meeting we will discuss the adoption of the full budget for 2022 . And we have some other resolutions that we want to get to, so let us begin. And $I$ would ask first if we could have a roll call, please.

MR. STATE: Roll call for the commissioners. I'm going to call the names of the commissioners who I believe are present already.

Commissioner Ansari?
COMMISSIONER ANSARI: I'm here.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Baynes?
COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Present.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Blue?
COMMISSIONER BLUE: Here.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Perry?
COMMISSIONER PERRY: Present and accounted for.
MR. STATE: Sister Denise?
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Here.
MR. STATE: And Commissioner Wilcox?
COMMISSIONER WILCOX: Present.
MR. STATE: Any other commissioners who are on the
call?

That does give us six. We do have a quorum. CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: We do have a quorum, so we will begin our business. May I ask Kim, please, to give us a report.

MS. MINKEL: Do you want approval of the minutes first, Sister?

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Oh, yes. Sorry about that.
MS. MINKEL: No, that's okay.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Let us approve the minutes of our last meeting in November. May I have a motion?

COMMISSIONER PERRY: So moved.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: And a second?

COMMISSIONER BLUE: Second. Reverend Blue.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you. Is there any discussion on the minutes?

MR. STATE: Sister, just for clarification, these are the October minutes.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Oh, because November was just a discussion. Okay.

MS. MINKEL: Right. Right.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Is there any discussion of the
minutes?
If not, all those in favor of accepting and approving the minutes of October, 2021 ?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: Aye.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Any negatives or abstentions?
Thank you. Now we'll have your report.
MS. MINKEL: Great. Thank you, Sister. So it's December, and at the end of the year, I always like to recap some of the Authority's highlights looking back throughout the year. You kind of forget how long -- or, how much is done in a year or how long a year lasts, especially in a pandemic.

So as we enter year two of the pandemic, the agency continued to provide critical services to help address needs related to the pandemic. This includes our sites -- using our sites as vaccination sites, we provided free bus passes to help get people vaccinated, and a number of our operators continue to provide food delivery services to those in need in the community.

Within our Metro operations, we ordered our first set of battery electric buses and we broke
ground on a new electrical substation to power these buses at our Cold Spring facility. We rolled out our new bus network improvement plan and we kicked off our bus stop balancing. And both of these efforts included significant public outreach and public hearings. Our team has also been busy installing new fare boxes along with new gates at the rail stations as part of our new fare collection system.

We always partnered with Merchants Insurance for a rehabilitated new station at seneca Street, and we look to start rehabilitation of the Erie Canal Harbor Station. We worked on improving public space by incorporating art on the $D L$ and $W$ building, within the Niagara Falls transportation center, and we are working with the community on improvements to the Freedom Wall. With a focus on improving public space, we advanced our DL and $W$ project to complete the track and catenary portion of the project and to start the construction of a new station.

We also invested in our existing rail stations by completing escalator replacements and
other station improvements. We focused on safety and the reliability of our system by completing phase ten of our fastener and pad replacement projects and completely replacing the main control communication system for our underground stations.

We continue to invest in technology, upgrading life expired systems, improving reliability and addressing security concerns. We also invest in the environment by expanding the de-icing wetland treatment system.

The airport is slowly rebounding and there's reason for optimism. For November, we have recovered back to almost seventy-seven percent of the November, 2019 traffic, and more than three hundred and thirty percent compared to November of 2020 traffic. Evidence of this recovery has been with the addition of new service. Southwest is flying to San Juan, Puerto Rico; Frontier Airlines added daily service to Fort Lauderdale and new seasonal service to Myrtle Beach and Cancun. We also will welcome a new airline with Sun Country who will begin summer seasonal
service to Minneapolis. And we completed the biggest upgrade in twenty years at the Buffalo airport. The seventy million dollar terminal enhancement project is rounding out completion with the baggage claim up and running four months ahead of schedule.

Our police continue to work towards accreditation and have contracted to have behavioral health crisis intervention services as additional support for our police behavioral team.

As a focus on safety and risk, our risk department had the largest recovery in the history of the organization that included two million in Workers' Comp. and claims recovery, and an additional two million in insurance claims related to CoVID, all because our director of risk maintained a rare extension of coverage for communicable diseases.

New York State gave us an A rating on our MWBE program. We had over thirty-six percent MWBE participation, including almost fifteen million spent with sixty-three different MWBE
suppliers. We also settled seven labor agreements, we hired a hundred and fifteen employees, including forty-three new operators and seventeen mechanics. Despite this, though, staffing remains a challenge. But, our team of operators, mechanics, engineers, managers, supervisors, police, custodians are doing a tremendous job working long hours as we continue to try to staff up for the critical services we provide.

And all that's been accomplished this year is due to the support of our board and the incredible work of our sixteen hundred employees who always go above and beyond. So I'm very proud to be part of this organization. I want to take a moment to express my sincere gratitude to our employees, especially my leadership team. Transportation's always challenging, especially during a pandemic, so thank you to everything that you've done this past year, realizing our mission and how important our work is to Western New York.

And on behalf of all the staff, $I$ wish to
thank the board for your support. I wish you all a very happy holiday and a prosperous new year and let's hope that things get back to normal soon. Thank you.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much, Kim. It's extraordinary to think of how much has been achieved in this past year, and that's in spite of all of the things that come up regularly that you have to deal with and you've done that so well. So $I$ would like to express our gratitude as a board for the outstanding work that you have done. So thank you all, all of you, for bringing to completion so many of these wonderful projects and getting new ones and getting the airport open again and keeping the buses running and everything. It's great. Thank you. Let us move on now to our corporate report.

I was not present at the meeting this morning, and Commissioner Perry chaired it. Is there anything you would like to report from that meeting?

COMMISSIONER PERRY: We went through all of the committees, but $I$ guess we can just take those as
we have resolutions. But nothing spectacular. It was kind of boring.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: The more boring, the better. COMMISSIONER PERRY: Yes.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: John, do you have anything? MR. COX: Yes. Thank you, Sister. Good afternoon, commissioners. I will be reporting on the month of October since we didn't report on it at the last meeting.

So for the month of October of 2021 , we had a positive variance to budget of approximately two million dollars; and on a fiscal year-to-date basis, a positive variance of approximately eighteen and a half million dollars.

Total operating revenues and assistance were above budget by approximately two point six million or fifteen point two percent for October, and fifteen point two million or eleven point seven percent on a fiscal year-to-date basis. We had higher than budget concessions and commissions, which includes parking, ride share, taxi and food and retail revenue, due to higher than anticipated enplanements. Metro experienced
higher passenger fares due to higher ridership than anticipated. State Transit Operating Assistance, we refer to it as STOA, was above budget. We had positive Erie County sales tax, mortgage tax for both October and on a fiscal year to date. And in addition, fiscal year to date we have seen higher BNIA airport fees and services which are from revenues from general aviation and air cargo fees.

Total operating expenses were below budget by approximately one point five million dollars or eight percent in October, and nine point nine million or seven point nine percent on a fiscal year-to-date basis. And that was primarily due to lower personnel service and maintenance and repairs, which were generally offset by higher utilities, insurance and injuries and various other puts and gets.

Now, before I conclude this -- the consolidated financial, $I$ just want to point one thing out. On the bottom of page nine. Just when I mentioned, you know, the positive variances you hear on a monthly basis, two
million or, you know, a positive variance of over about eighteen and a half million on a year-to-date basis -- if you look at the first column there, that's our year-to-date budget. And at the bottom, we originally, when we put this budget together back in February or March earlier this year, you know, we were in the midst of the depths of COVID. So if you can look, we were anticipating at that point in time having actually a deficit of a little over about twelve point two million dollars. And if you look at our actuals, which is the next column over, we actually are looking at a surplus of about six point four million dollars.

And the point I'd like to make is, you know, when you hear these numbers, you know, those are significant numbers and significant variances, but much of this, you know, positive variance that we're seeing and the fact that we're not in a deficit but we're in a surplus is because of increased ridership, we're seeing increased enplanements at the airport and not to forget also all of the federal assistance that we've
received for covid relief.
So that really is what -- you know, we're certainly -- where we were and what we were anticipating and where we are are, you know, we're in a much better place, but we're still in the process of recovery. And we're looking -that's what we, you know, anticipate over the next couple of years is a full recovery. But, I just wanted to point that out because $I$ thought that that was important because of the numbers I'm talking about being so high on the variances. CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: And it's all the unexpected, both the good news and the not so good news. MR. COX: That's true. And we may have some more bumps along the way, but we're certainly headed in the right direction.

And unless there are any questions, that concludes the consolidated financials. CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you. And we will begin now with the corporate resolutions. And I suggest we take number one, which is the adoption of the operating and capital budgets for next year. And I'm going to turn this over to Kim.

MS. MINKEL: Thank you, Sister. On page fifteen is a resolution for the board to consider adoption of our fiscal year-ending ' 23 budget for the NFTA and NFT Transit Metro system.

The consolidated budget is the amount of two hundred and eighty-eight million dollars. Some of the highlights. As John had mentioned earlier today, the budget assumes no fare increase. Ten years without a fare increase. It assumes a STOA increase of ten percent, two percent increase in Erie County sales tax, one percent increase in mortgage recording tax and federal operating assistance increasing by fifteen million dollars or twenty-three point three percent, recognizing the federal assistance that we received.

Expecting enplanement levels close to pre-pandemic levels at the Buffalo airport and about sixty-five percent of pre-pandemic levels for the Niagara Falls airport. We're assuming bus ridership will be down by fifty percent and sixty percent for rail, as compared to pre-COVID numbers in this budget.

And increases in expenses of almost
twenty-two million, or ten and a half percent, as we increase service back to pre-pandemic levels going forward.

Just a couple of significant capital projects that are included in this budget. The 5-23 runway improvements that Bill had mentioned earlier, our DL and $W$ terminal project, electric buses, improvements to our facilities, investment in $I T$ including security upgrades, and the fare collection project as we finish that up.

Capital improvements in our rail system including track work, catenary work, escalators and station rehab and continue with the engineering and preliminary design for our rail extension project.

I also want to mention as part of our budget, you know, the losses that we've experienced since the beginning of the pandemic have been significant in terms of lost ridership, passengers, operating assistance and revenue. And this really would have been devastating on our operations, but for the federal funding, which has really allowed us to stabilize and take
the important critical steps to make our system as safe as possible, so we are incredibly appreciative of the Infrastructure Investment Jobs Act and we thank Senators Schumer, Gillibrand and Congressmen Higgins and Jacobs for their support on the federal assistance. That's really made the difference for this budget. So that's that item, Sister.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much. Let me begin by taking a motion to accept the budget. COMMISSIONER PERRY: So moved. CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: And a second?

COMMISSIONER BLUE: Second. Reverend Blue.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you. Now, are there any questions --
(Whereupon, Commissioner Baynes left the proceedings.)

MS. MINKEL: Oh, no.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Who is this?
COMMISSIONER PERRY: He'll be back. It was Anthony. CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Are there any questions?

We can -- we just lost one of the
commissioners and, therefore, we don't have a
quorum, so perhaps we could go through the other resolutions and return to this one when we have another commissioner or when Commissioner Baynes comes back.

MR. STATE: Yes.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Okay.
MS. MINKEL: Sure.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Forgive the interruption, but we want to wait until we have a quorum for this one. Thank you.

So, Kim, if you would take us through number two through eight, please.

MS. MINKEL: Sure. Happy to do so, Sister.
Oh, there he is.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Anthony is back.
MS. MINKEL: So we had a motion and we have second.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Good. And we have a second.
Are there any comments or questions in
regard to the budget?
(Whereupon, Commissioner Baynes returned to
the proceedings.)
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you. Any questions?
If not, we'll have a roll call vote, please.

MR. STATE: So this is a vote on corporate --
(Whereupon, Commissioner Hughes joined the proceedings.)

MR. STATE: So roll call vote on corporate item number one. It's been firsted by Commissioner Perry, seconded by Commissioner Blue. Roll call vote.

Commissioner Ansari?
COMMISSIONER ANSARI: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Baynes?
COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Blue?
COMMISSIONER BLUE: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Hughes?
COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Perry?
COMMISSIONER PERRY: Aye.
MR. STATE: Sister?
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Yes.
MR. STATE: And Commissioner Wilcox?
COMMISSIONER WILCOX: Yes.
MR. STATE: Item passes.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much. Now we'll
take number two through eight.
MS. MINKEL: Okay. Thank you, Sister. On page eighteen, staff is recommending an authorization for agreement with Clearsky Consulting. This is for our Infor support system that -- Infor is a product that we use to support our human resource department, payroll and other core functions within the Authority. The term of the agreement would be three years with the option of two additional one-year periods at our discretion. The annual contract cost will be a hundred and forty-eight thousand eight hundred dollars, with established hourly fees and rates for any additional services.

We did issue an RFP in accordance with our procurement guidelines, and we did receive three responsive proposals. Clearsky was rated the highest. Empire State Development has excluded this procurement from MWBE requirements because there are no New York State certified providers; and, likewise, we have exempted SDVOB requirements as well. The third corporate resolution on page
twenty-one is an agreement with FirstLight. This is for Internet connectivity. This would be a three-year agreement in the amount of eleven thousand seventy-six dollars. This is being procured off of the New York state contract at a monthly fee of nine hundred and twenty-three dollars, and this will provide both diversity and redundancy in terms of Internet connection for the Authority going forward.

The fourth corporate resolution is a term agreement with D.V. Brown and Associates. This is for HVAC services. The initial term would be for three years, which are renewed annually at our discretion. The cost per year is estimated to be about sixty-seven thousand five hundred. This is for any unplanned issues that might occur with our maintenance of the system. Any replacements or larger-term items would be bid out separately.

We did go out with an RFP. We received three responsive proposals. D.V. Brown scored the highest. The established MBE, WBE and SDVOB goals are sixteen percent, fourteen percent and
six percent, respectively. D.V. Brown has identified that they can meet these requirements.

The fifth corporate resolution on page twenty-five is an agreement with Grove Roofing for roof rehabilitation on our 485 Cayuga Road property. It's for a fixed amount of two hundred and forty-three thousand six hundred and fifty dollars. This is to do the repairs on the parapet wall to address leaks that we have over some of the common-use spaces and tenant spaces.

We did go out with a request for proposal. Three proposals were received, but only one of them was deemed responsive, which was Grove Roofing. The established MBE/WBE goals were ten percent and eight percent, respectively; and Grove Roofing has identified their MBE participation as one percent, and seven point three nine percent for WBE participation. They have requested that ESD approve a partial waiver of the MWBE goals because there are no certified subcontractors -- or, excuse me. There's a limited number of certified subcontractors, and we have excluded this from the SDVOB goals as
well.
Corporate resolution number six is on page twenty-eight. This is an authorization for agreement with New York Power Authority. This is to utilize their Web-based platform to manage our semiannual reporting requirements. There's a requirement that we have that is part of the New York State Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act. There's a directive that state agencies will reduce energy consumption by twenty-five percent by year 2026. So there are annual reporting requirements that we have. This agreement will allow us to put that information into this Web-portal-based platform through NYPA which will make reporting easier, given that we have eighteen eligible buildings with thirty-seven total utility accounts that all need to be entered manually each month.

NYPA is utilizing a grant funding from petroleum overcharge restitution fund to make this service available to BuildSmart 2025 agencies, which we're one of them, at no cost.

The next resolution on page thirty is an
authorization for procurement through NYSERDA for renewable energy credits and zero emission credits through the NFTA. This would be for a five-year term that would begin in January of 2022. We are required by New York State as a load serving entity to purchase both renewable energy credits and zero emission credits. This requirement goes back to 2017. We purchase electricity directly through NYISO, the wholesale market, so the energy standard mandates apply to all LSEs, which is our entity, in the state of New York.

The amount of zero emission credits and renewable energy credits needs percentage increases up to 2030. There's a number of targets. And this agreement allows NYSERDA to make those changes and purchase those credits for us.

In terms of approximate cost, in year 2022 we expect that the renewable energy credits will be about seventy thousand in addition to our current energy needs, and a hundred thousand in 2023. And the zero emission credits for both --
for ' 22 and ' 23 to be over two hundred thousand in terms of the additional cost.

And corporate resolution number eight on page thirty-three is a lease amendment with Elettromar at our 485 Cayuga Road facility. They've been a tenant since January of 2018 . They're looking for additional storage space of seven hundred and twenty-nine square feet. The rate would be four fifty a square foot starting in January of next year, and the agreement would end with their current lease which is set to expire December 31st of 2022. That will add an additional thirty-two eighty over the twelve-month period in terms of rent revenue.

And those are the corporate resolutions two through eight, Sister.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much, Kim.
May I ask for a motion to approve corporate resolutions two through eight, please?

Someone make a motion, please.
COMMISSIONER BLUE: I'll make a motion to approve the resolutions. Reverend Blue.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you. And a second?

COMMISSIONER ANSARI: LaVonne. Second. CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much.

Are there any questions on any of these resolutions? Any comments?

If not, I will ask David State to take a roll call.

MR. STATE: Roll call vote.
Commissioner Ansari?
COMMISSIONER ANSARI: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Baynes?
Commissioner Baynes once again?
Commissioner Blue?
COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes for Baynes.
COMMISSIONER BLUE: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Baynes recorded as a yes.
Commissioner Blue recorded as a yes.
Commissioner Hughes?
COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Perry?
COMMISSIONER PERRY: Voting in the affirmative on all
but number four on which I'm abstaining. So affirmative on everything except for an abstention on four.

MR. STATE: Sister Denise?
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Yes.
MR. STATE: And Commissioner Wilcox?
COMMISSIONER WILCOX: Yes.
MR. STATE: Items pass.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much. And we move on to aviation business group. And, Commissioner Perry, do you have any comments for us?

COMMISSIONER PERRY: Yes, I do. The aviation committee met earlier today, and just some highlights from the committee are that the four carousels are now working in the new baggage claim area. And we're going to do some fine-tuning on the logistics as to where the baggage service offices are so that the area works more efficiently for travelers. But, it's just a spectacular accomplishment ahead of schedule. And now international service will service through the regular baggage claim area without any unusual routing.

Now, with the terminal enhancements complete, there's significant statistics on air
service rebound. It's (inaudible) underway. We're looking forward to getting back to pre-pandemic numbers and planning for future air travel. Mr. Vanecek covered various service expansions and positive changes for Frontier, Sun Country and Spirit at Niagara Falls International Airport. And Spirit noted the April -- April Myrtle Beach additions. One important feature of the committee meeting was the fire truck parade in Lancaster which our equipment participated in. And those are the highlights.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very, very much. And, Bill, do you have anything to add?

MR. VANECEK: No. I think Mr. Perry summed it up nicely.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you so much. I'll turn it over to Kim for the resolutions.

MS. MINKEL: Thank you, Sister. There are three resolutions within aviation. The first starts on page thirty-six. Staff is recommending an agreement with Airport Lighting Corporation in the lump sum amount of a hundred and twenty-seven thousand nine hundred and sixty dollars forty-six
cents. This is to replace seventy-five metal halide apron lights that are mounted on the passenger terminal at the Buffalo airport. They will be replaced with highly efficient LED lights that -- the benefit of the LED lights, while reducing energy consumption, it also provided brighter lights, but it also reduces pilot glare, so certainly this will be an improvement at the airport.

Staff did go out with a request for proposal. Three responsive proposals were received. Airport Lighting Corporation scored the highest and also has the lowest cost. Empire State Development excluded this procurement from MWBE requirements because there are no New York State certified providers of these products. OGS excluded procurement from $S$ DVOB because there's no certified providers as well.

The second resolution is with -- that staff is recommending is for the perimeter boundary fencing at the Niagara Falls airport with New York State Fence Incorporated for a lump sum amount of three hundred and ninety-nine thousand
seven hundred twelve dollars and fifty cents. This is a project that Bill had mentioned earlier today, enclosing the recently purchased property on the west end of Niagara Falls airport. It would add approximately eighty-eight hundred linear feet of fence.

Now, this is an item that the board had approved back in April with Bogner -- where the agreement was with Bogner Construction. The contractor was unable to execute the contract terms at that time due to shortages and delivery delays, so we rebid and New York State Fence is the lowest bid. They are meeting the established MBE, WBE and SDVOB goals for this project.

And the last item in aviation is an
authorization for a lease amendment with Truman Arnold Companies, also known as TAC Air, for 485 Cayuga Road. So TAC Air came in and had signed a consent to assignment and assumption of obligations as it related to Prior who previously operated as the $F B O$ for aviation at the Buffalo airport. TAC Air is requesting to amend their current lease by adding additional space known as
bay five that's located next to Executive Airshare at our 485 Cayuga Road facility. So as part of this additional space, it will include over twenty-six thousand square feet of hangar space at a rate of five dollars and fifty cents per square foot, just under three thousand square feet of class $C$ minus office space at a rate of ten dollars per square foot, and just over eighty-four thousand six hundred square feet of associated ramp space that's shared at a rate of point o one two five per square foot. The terminal lease will be coterminous with the existing lease that TAC had assumed of the Prior lease that is expected to expire on December 31st, 2036. It will add additional revenue of three million three hundred and ninety-eight thousand seven dollars and ninety-one cents over the term of the lease.

TAC Air has also committed to invest a minimum of three quarters of a million dollars into the facility, and these improvements will be done no later than next December, a year from now. The first three months of the lease will be
rent-free while this construction is taking place, and then they will provide rent payments going forward. So we think this is exciting. It's great to see investment over at our 485 Cayuga Road facility. It's even more exciting to see the hangar space being used for what it was built for, for aviation activity.

So those are the three resolutions within aviation.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: That's exciting news. That's very good. Very good.

We have three resolutions for aviation, and we can take those as a group. May I have a motion to accept the three resolutions?

COMMISSIONER PERRY: So moved.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: And a second, please?
COMMISSIONER BLUE: Second. Reverend Blue.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you. Is there any
question or comment on any of the three resolutions?

Hearing none, we will turn to a roll call vote, please.

MR. STATE: Commissioner Ansari?

COMMISSIONER ANSARI: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Baynes?
COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Blue?
COMMISSIONER BLUE: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Hughes?
COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Perry?
COMMISSIONER PERRY: Affirmative.
MR. STATE: Sister Denise?
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Yes.
MR. STATE: And Commissioner Wilcox?
COMMISSIONER WILCOX: Yes.
MR. STATE: Items carry.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you all. That carries.
Now surface transportation business report, and, Tom George, do you have anything you would like to tell us?

MR. GEORGE: Yeah. We did have a surface
transportation committee meeting this morning. We had a discussion item where we talked about customer satisfaction surveys. We had an interesting conversation about the demographic
participation in that and looking for opportunities to have that demographic more accurately reflect what our ridership is as a challenge for us moving into next year. We did identify the comparison with our peers as well as ourselves over time and using those tools to identify areas of focus for the next year moving forward.

We did discuss our initiatives briefly. We talked about Niagara Falls service and how that has gone into actual service as of sunday of -last Sunday, December 8th, and is now operating. We do have staff in the field and we are monitoring that and meeting with our riders on a regular basis as it rolls out to determine if there's changes that we should be considering.

I talked a little bit about ridership and indicated that our bus ridership is up four percent over last year and our rail ridership is up twenty-eight percent over last year, which gets us approximately a little less than sixty percent of pre-pandemic numbers. So we got into that.

And then $I$ also reported on both the accessibility advisory committee and the citizens advisory committee, and both of those committees' next meeting is on January 27 th of the new year. And that's all for my report.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much, Tom. We have seven resolutions under surface transportation, and $I$ believe we can take those as a group.

MS. MINKEL: Yes, that's right, Sister, there are six starting on page forty-five. The first, staff is recommending an award to Mark Cerrone and WSP. And this is for the rehabilitation of our Erie Canal Harbor Station. For the construction contract, the lump sum total bid amount is two million five hundred and sixty-seven thousand seven hundred dollars; and to WSP for the design support at a cost plus fixed fee not to exceed a hundred and eighteen thousand a hundred and seventy-three dollars. I believe it was at the October meeting Tom had shown the board renderings of what the new station would look like.

We did go out and public advertise this work. Three potential bidders responded. Mark Cerrone was the lowest. The established MBE, WBE and SDVOB goals were ten percent, twelve percent and seven percent. Mark Cerrone has identified their MBE participation as seven point two percent and their $W B E$ participation as nine point nine percent and their $S D V O B$ participation as two point three percent.

The second resolution in surface is an authorization for a change order with Scheidt and Bachmann as part of our fare collection system upgrade to increase the amount by three hundred and eight thousand seven hundred and eleven dollars and two cents. This is to add more ticket vending machines. As we're building out a new rail station at the $D L$ and $W$, we need to install four new ticket vending machines at the three hundred and eight thousand seven hundred dollar cost that $I$ had mentioned. So this would be an increase in the contract to provide for those four additional ticket vending machines. The third surface resolution on page
forty-nine is an authorization to procure vehicles -- street supervisor vehicles from DeLacy Ford under the OGS contract. The cost per vehicle is thirty-four thousand four hundred and forty dollars and forty-seven cents. This is to replace three similar model year 2013 vehicles that have exceeded their useful life. And I asked Tom, how many miles do these vehicles have? Two hundred and thirty-five thousand on one, a hundred and seventy-nine thousand on the other and a hundred and sixty-seven thousand. These are well-used vehicles --

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: I guess so.
MS. MINKEL: -- that our street supervisors use out there. The MWBE/SDVOB goals are not applicable to purchases made under the OGS contract.

The fourth resolution under corporate is a different approach that we haven't done before. We have a new manager of procurement, Mark Pereira, who is doing wonderful things for us and has looked at the inventory of parts that we maintain for our buses and any unique parts. And they're normally sole source procurements. He's
identified all of those and put together this strategic procurement that will provide thirty to forty thousand dollars' worth of savings. Not a huge amount, but $I$ think the biggest thing is it helps us to identify the parts, allocate the parts for our suppliers. Especially with supply chain issues becoming an issue, to flag these parts in advance so that we don't suffer with supply chain problems for the next year, or hopefully we can minimize that.

The cost of this sole source procurement from the manufacturers listed below, and there are four manufacturers, Gillig, Prevost, March Networks and Landi Renzo USA. The approximate cost is six hundred and eighty-nine thousand six hundred and eighty-six dollars for these unique and proprietary parts from those vendors. And this is excluded from the MWBE requirements because there are no New York State certified providers of these products.

The fifth resolution. Staff is recommending that the board, for the benefit and solely in its capacity as the administrative host agency of the

Niagara International Transportation Technology Coalition, NITTEC, award a consultant contract with Parsons Transportation Group in the lump sum amount of five million six hundred and thirty-nine thousand seven hundred and ninety dollars. And that additionally consulting support service be awarded to WSP in the lump sum amount of six hundred and eighty-nine thousand six hundred and sixty-nine dollars and twelve cents.

And with us today is Athena Hutchins, the executive director of NITTEC, to talk a little bit about the project because I will not do it justice. And it really is exciting for the community, so I asked Athena to come and talk a little bit about this project.

MS. HUTCHINS: Great. Thank you, Kim. So back in 2016, working with NFTA, we submitted for a grant with Federal Highway Administration. It was the first go-around of this new grant program. It's called the Advanced Transportation and Congestion Management Technologies Deployment Initiative. So we have -- we were successful in winning seven
point eight million dollars for this region to deploy technology to help us mitigate congestion management. And really a lot of the focus was around working with multiple agencies. There's an aspect to working across borders to make sure we're minimizing delays at the border as well. So it's an exciting project for us. This is phase two. We completed phase one just earlier this year, so now we're into phase two which is implementing the technology for this program. So we will be deploying a multi-agency technology enabled integrated regional mobility management system. Really working with all the different partner agencies, with NITTEC and NFTA included, where we're going to be able to tie in information and be able to share that information on a regular basis. So it's a very exciting program. We also have consulting services to support us during this project. It's a two-year project with a completion of December 2023. So it is very exciting for this region all working together to help mitigate congestion.

MS. MINKEL: Great. Thank you, Athena.

And then the final resolution of the day is an authorization for agreement with GObike Buffalo. This is for consulting services. And, similarly, staff is recommending that the board, for the benefit of and solely in its capacity as the administrative host agency for the Greater Buffalo Niagara Regional Transportation Council, or GBNRTC, authorize an agreement with GObike Buffalo in the amount not to exceed two hundred and eight thousand eight hundred dollars.

This is consulting services for a regional bike plan. It would be a two-year contract. Under NFTA procurement guidelines, they did publicly advertise, received five responsive proposals. GObike scored the highest.

Similarly, on the line $I$ have Rich Guarino, who is the executive director of GBNRTC in case the board has any questions on this project. But, for new board members, both NITTEC and GBNRTC, the NFTA acts as the host agency for both of these wonderful organizations. They do their procurements through the NFTA. Their board and funding is separate from the NFTA, but the
administrative approvals do come to the NFTA, so that's why both the GBNRTC item and the NITTEC item come before this board.

And, Rich, I don't know if you have anything you want to say on this item.

MR. GUARINO: The only thing I just wanted to add was that this wasn't for the study. The study was completed last year. This is for the implementation of the study, so it's an agreement for support services to implement the regional bike plan.

MS. MINKEL: Great. Thank you, Rich.
And, Sister, those are the resolutions.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Some exciting things happening.
Unless there's an objection, we'll take all
seven of the -- or, six, excuse me, together.
And $I$ would like to ask for a motion to accept the six resolutions, please.

Motion for acceptance.
COMMISSIONER BAYNES: So moved. Anthony.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you, Anthony.
And a second?
COMMISSIONER WILCOX: Second. Phil Wilcox.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you, Phil.
Are there any questions, comments?
Hearing none, we will call for a roll call vote.

MR. STATE: Roll call vote. Commissioner Ansari? COMMISSIONER ANSARI: Yes.

MR. STATE: Commissioner Baynes?
COMMISSIONER BAYNES: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Blue?
COMMISSIONER BLUE: Yes.
MR. STATE: Commissioner Hughes? COMMISSIONER HUGHES: Yes.

MR. STATE: Commissioner Perry?
COMMISSIONER PERRY: I'm voting in the affirmative on
all except for numbers one and three on which $I$ am abstaining. Affirmative on all the rest.

MR. STATE: Sister Denise?
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Yes.
MR. STATE: And Commissioner Wilcox?
COMMISSIONER WILCOX: Yes.
MR. STATE: Items carry.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you very much. All of
those passed, and it gives all of you a lot of
work to start out on again for the next month. David, is there a general counsel report?

MR. STATE: Yes, Sister. I provided a general counsel report for the commissioners who are physically here, it's in the book, and we e-mailed it separately to the other commissioners. Just to advise the board of a trial that's coming up in January. It's an accident involving a bike and a Metro bus. And we have bifurcated the trial, so it's capped damages. So the jury will tell us who's at fault and at what proportion they are at fault, and then when we get that number, we will apply that to the stipulated damage amount.

The jury is scheduled in front of Judge Siwek. It's scheduled to be four days. And Vicky is trying this case. Vicky is actually picking a jury as we speak. So the judicial system is very much back from the pandemic. We had two trials scheduled for this month and we have this particular trial scheduled for January. Thank you.

CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: Thank you for supplying us with
that report.
Unless one of the commissioners suggests it, we have no need for an executive session.

Is there anyone who would like an executive session today?

If not, may $I$ ask for a motion for adjournment?

COMMISSIONER PERRY: So moved.
CHAIR SISTER ROCHE: And a second?
I'm sure it's out there. We are adjourned for today. I want to wish everybody happy holidays and be careful as you do all your business between now and January and watch the snow.

MS. MINKEL: Thank you all.

*     *         *             *                 * 

STATE OE NEW YORK)
SS:
COUNTY OF NIAGARA)

I, Valerie A. Rosati, a Notary Public in and for the state of New York, County of Niagara, DO HEREBY CERTIFY that the above transcript of a video recording was taken down by me in a verbatim manner by means of Machine Shorthand, and that the transcript was then reduced into writing under my direction.

I further CERTIFY that the above-described transcript constitutes a true and accurate and complete transcript of the video recording.


VALERIE A. ROSATI,
Notary Public.








| ```8:13, 8:15, 14:6, 14:8 reduce [1] - 23:10 reduced [1] - 46:10 reduces [1] - 29:7 reducing [1] - 29:6 redundancy [1] - 21:8 refer [1] - 12:3 reflect [1]-34:3 regard [1] - 18:19 region [2]-40:1, 40:21 regional [3] - 40:12, 41:11, 42:10 Regional [1] - 41:7 regular [4]-2:22, 27:20, 34:15, 40:17 regularly [1] - 10:8 rehab [1] - 16:13 rehabilitated [1] - 6:11 rehabilitation [3] - 6:12, 22:5, 35:13 related [3]-5:16, 8:17, 30:20 reliability [2] - 7:2, 7:9 relief [1] - 14:1 remains[1]-9:5 renderings [1] - 35:22 renewable [4] - 24:2, 24:6, 24:14, 24:20 renewed [1]-21:13 rent [3]-25:14, 32:1, 32:2 rent-free [1] - 32:1 Renzo [1] - 38:14 repairs [2]-12:16, 22:8 replace [2]-29:1, 37:6 replaced [1] - 29:4 replacement [1]-7:4 replacements [2] - 6:23, 21:18 replacing [1] - 7:4 report [10] - 4:5, 5:6, 10:17, 10:20, 11:8, 33:16, 35:5, 44:2, 44:4, 45:1 reported [1] - 35:1 reporting [4]-11:7, 23:6, 23:12, 23:15 request [2]-22:11, 29:10 requested [1] - 22:19 requesting[1] - 30:22 required [1]-24:5``` | $\begin{aligned} & \text { requirement [2] - } \\ & \text { 23:7, 24:8 } \\ & \text { requirements [7] - } \\ & 20: 19,20: 22,22: 2, \\ & 23: 6,23: 12,29: 15, \\ & 38: 18 \\ & \text { resolution }[13]- \\ & 15: 2,20: 23,21: 10, \\ & 22: 3,23: 2,23: 23, \\ & 25: 3,29: 19,36: 10, \\ & 36: 23,37: 17,38: 21, \\ & 41: 1 \\ & \text { resolutions }[17] \text { - } \\ & 3: 5,11: 1,14: 20,18: 2, \\ & 25: 15,25: 19,25: 22, \\ & 26: 4,28: 17,28: 19, \\ & 32: 8,32: 12,32: 14, \\ & 32: 20,35: 7,42: 13, \\ & 42: 18 \\ & \text { resource }[1]-20: 6 \\ & \text { Resources }[1]-2: 6 \\ & \text { respectively }[2]- \\ & 22: 1,22: 15 \\ & \text { responded }[1]-36: 2 \\ & \text { responsive }[5]- \\ & 20: 17,21: 21,22: 13, \\ & 29: 11,41: 14 \\ & \text { rest }[1]-43: 16 \\ & \text { restitution }[1]- \\ & 23: 20 \\ & \text { retail }[1]-11: 22 \\ & \text { return }[1]-18: 2 \\ & \text { returned }[1]-18: 20 \\ & \text { Rev }[1]-2: 14 \\ & \text { revenue }[4]-11: 22, \\ & 16: 20,25: 14,31: 15 \\ & \text { revenues }[2]-11: 15, \\ & 12: 8 \\ & \text { Reverend }[4]-4: 15, \\ & 17: 13,25: 22,32: 17 \\ & \text { RFP }[2]-20: 15, \\ & 21: 20 \\ & \text { Rich }[4]-2: 15, \\ & 41: 16,42: 4,42: 12 \\ & \text { Rico }[1]-7: 19 \\ & \text { ride }[1]-11: 21 \\ & \text { riders }[1]-34: 14 \\ & \text { ridership }[8]-12: 1, \\ & 13: 21,15: 20,16: 19, \\ & 34: 3,34: 17,34: 18, \\ & 34: 19 \\ & \text { risk }[3]-8: 12,8: 18 \\ & \text { Road }[5]-22: 5,25: 5, \\ & 30: 18,31: 2,32: 5 \\ & \text { ROCHE }[48]-2: 18, \\ & 3: 20,4: 3,4: 8,4: 10, \\ & 4: 14,4: 16,4: 20,4: 23, \\ & 5: 5,10: 5,11: 3,11: 5, \\ & 14: 12,14: 19,17: 9, \\ & 17: 12,17: 14,17: 19, \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 17: 21,18: 6,18: 8 \text {, } \\ & 18: 15,18: 17,18: 22, \\ & 19: 19,19: 23,25: 17, \\ & 25: 23,26: 2,27: 2, \\ & 27: 6,28: 12,28: 16, \\ & 32: 10,32: 16,32: 18 \text {, } \\ & 33: 11,33: 15,35: 6, \\ & 37: 13,42: 14,42: 21 \text {, } \\ & 43: 1,43: 18,43: 22 \text {, } \\ & 44: 23,45: 9 \\ & \text { Roche }[1]-2: 2 \\ & \text { roll }[10]-3: 7,3: 8 \text {, } \\ & 18: 23,19: 4,19: 6, \\ & 26: 6,26: 7,32: 21 \text {, } \\ & 43: 3,43: 5 \\ & \text { rolled }[1]-6: 3 \\ & \text { rolls }[1]-34: 15 \\ & \text { roof }[1]-22: 5 \\ & \text { Roofing }[3]-22: 4, \\ & 22: 14,22: 16 \\ & \text { Rosati }[1]-46: 5 \\ & \text { ROSAT] }[2]-1: 17, \\ & \text { 46:17 } \\ & \text { rounding }[1]-8: 4 \\ & \text { routing }[1]-27: 21 \\ & \text { Ruminski }[1]-2: 8 \\ & \text { running }[2]-8: 5, \\ & \text { 10:15 } \\ & \text { runway }[1]-16: 6 \end{aligned}$S <br> safe $[1]-17: 2$ <br> safety $[2]-7: 2,8: 12$ <br> sales $[2]-12: 4$, <br> $15: 11$ <br> San $_{[1]}-7: 19$ <br> satisfaction $[1]-$ <br> $33: 22$ <br> savings $[1]-38: 3$ <br> Schaefer $[1]-2: 6$ <br> schedule $[2]-8: 6$, <br> $27: 19$ <br> scheduled $[4]-$ <br> $44: 15,44: 16,44: 20$, <br> $44: 21$ <br> Scheidt $[1]-36: 11$ <br> Schumer $[1]-17: 4$ <br> scored $[3]-21: 21$, <br> $29: 12,41: 15$ <br> SDVOB $[7]-20: 21$, <br> $21: 22,22: 23,29: 17$, <br> $30: 14,36: 4,36: 8$ <br> seasonal $[2]-7: 21$, <br> $7: 23$ <br> second $[15]-4: 14$, <br> $4: 15,17: 12,17: 13$, <br> $18: 16,18: 17,25: 23$, <br> $26: 1,29: 19,32: 16$, <br> $32: 17,36: 10,42: 22$, | ```42:23, 45:9 seconded [1] - 19:6 security [2]-7:9, 16:9 see [2] - 32:4, 32:6 seeing [2] - 13:19, 13:21 semiannual [1] - 23:6 Senators [1] - 17:4 Seneca[1] - 6:11 separate[1]-41:23 separately [2] - 21:19, 44:6 service[15] - 7:18, 7:20, 7:21, 8:1, 12:15, 16:2, 23:21, 27:16, 27:19, 27:20, 28:1, 28:4, 34:10, 34:11, 39:7 services [11] - 5:15, 5:21, 8:9, 9:9, 12:8, 20:14, 21:12, 40:18, 41:3, 41:11, 42:10 serving [1] - 24:6 session [2] - 45:3, 45:5 set [2] - 5:23, 25:11 settled [1] - 9:1 seven [23]-7:14, 9:1, 11:19, 12:13, 21:15, 22:17, 23:17, 25:8, 28:22, 30:1, 31:17, 35:7, 35:16, 35:17, 36:5, 36:6, 36:14, 36:19, 37:5, 37:11, 39:5, 39:23, 42:16 seventeen[1] - 9:4 seventy[7]-7:14, 8:3, 21:4, 24:21, 29:1, 35:20, 37:10 seventy-five [1] - 29:1 seventy-nine [1] - 37:10 seventy-seven [1] - 7:14 seventy-six [1] - 21:4 seventy-three [1] - 35:20 share [2] - 11:21, 40:16 shared [1] - 31:10 shortages [1] - 30:11 Shorthand [1] - 46:9 shown [1] - 35:21 signed [1] - 30:18 significant [6]-6:5,``` | $\begin{gathered} \text { 13:17, 16:4, 16:19, } \\ \text { 27:23 } \\ \text { similar }[1]-37: 6 \\ \text { similarly }[2]-41: 4, \\ 41: 16 \\ \text { sincere }[1]-9: 16 \\ \text { Sister }[16]-2: 2, \\ 3: 19,4: 7,4: 18,5: 7, \\ \text { 11:6, 15:1, 17:8, } \\ \text { 18:13, 20:2, 25:16, } \\ \text { 28:18, 35:10, 42:13, } \\ \text { 43:17, 44:3 } \\ \text { SISTER }[48]-2: 18, \\ 3: 20,4: 3,4: 8,4: 10, \\ 4: 14,4: 16,4: 20,4: 23, \\ 5: 5,10: 5,11: 3,11: 5, \\ 14: 12,14: 19,17: 9, \\ 17: 12,17: 14,17: 19, \\ 17: 21,18: 6,18: 8, \\ 18: 15,18: 17,18: 22, \\ 19: 19,19: 23,25: 17, \\ 25: 23,26: 2,27: 2, \\ 27: 6,28: 12,28: 16, \\ 32: 10,32: 16,32: 18, \\ 33: 11,33: 15,35: 6, \\ 37: 13,42: 14,42: 21, \\ 43: 1,43: 18,43: 22, \\ 44: 23,45: 9 \\ \text { sister }[3]-19: 18, \\ 27: 1,33: 10 \\ \text { sites }[3]-5: 17,5: 18 \\ \text { Siwek }[1]-44: 16 \\ \text { six }[21]-4: 2,8: 21, \\ 11: 16,13: 13,21: 4, \\ 22: 1,22: 7,23: 2, \\ 28: 20,28: 23,31: 4, \\ 31: 9,35: 10,38: 15, \\ 38: 16,39: 4,39: 8, \\ 39: 9,42: 16,42: 18 \\ \text { sixteen }[2]-9: 13, \\ 21: 23 \\ \text { sixty }[9]-8: 23, \\ 15: 18,15: 21,21: 15, \\ 28: 23,34: 21,35: 16, \\ 37: 11,39: 9 \\ \text { sixty-five }[1]-15: 18 \\ \text { sixty-nine }[1]-39: 9 \\ \text { sixty-seven }[3]- \\ 21: 15,35: 16,37: 11 \\ \text { sixty-three }[1]-8: 23 \\ \text { slowly }[1]-7: 12 \\ \text { snow }[1]-45: 14 \\ \text { sole }[2]-37: 23, \\ 38: 11 \\ \text { solely }[2]-38: 22, \\ 41: 5 \\ \text { someone }[1]-25: 20 \\ \text { soon }[1]-10: 4 \\ \text { sorry }[1]-4: 8 \\ \text { source }[2]-37: 23, \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |




